23. As yet there has been no systematic provision of other educational facilities for refugee children, though a number of proposals have been made. The staff of the Education Cell have produced an extensive set of proposals for the development of existing educational facilities at all levels in the province, to enable them to also absorb the further task of educating the refugees in their currently overburdened facilities. The estimated cost would be some US$14.5 millions. As yet no source of finance for these proposals has been found. More specifically, the creation of vacotional training facilities for refugee youths and girls has been suggested, though this has not yet been formulated in detail. There are differences of opinion as to whether refugees could be absorbed into existing institutions which have vacant places, whether separate classes should be started for them, or whether totally new vocational training facilities need to be created. Pending assessments of the educational background of the refugees, to be undertaken by the Refugee Education Cell, and of the skills available among them, under preparation by the Small Industries Development Board of the provincial government, it is premature to attempt to formulate detailed training proposals in this direction. According to the Commissioner for Refugees, about 20 carpet-weaving centres are in existence, but no detailed information on their functioning has been compiled - the majority of the refugees do not have any background in this activity.

24. A great deal of energy and effort has gone into the planning and establishment of refugee education facilities in the province, and the achievement this represents deserves recognition. Nevertheless, some critical comments are also in order, in particular as to the quality and efficacity of what has been established. The number of refugees coming to attend the tented schools is frequently less than had been anticipated, and one reason is felt to be that they represent an unacceptably low level of facilities. It is certainly the

./...

case that a tent containing several different grades represents an inadequate atmosphere for learning. There is also little control over the capacity of the teachers, whose claimed qualification can seldom be verified. The Chairman of the Textbook Development Board in Peshawar has also queried the accepability and appropriateness of the textbooks currently being used by the refugees. In short, the enrolment of refugee children in primary schools is increasing, but it is doubtful how much progress this represents in educational terms.

25. However, one further qualifying remark is in order. The local Pakistani schools, especially those occupying rented premises, are at least as deficient in educational inputs as the refugees schools, and generally much more congested. Thus, if action is to be taken to improve the quality of refugee education facilities, it is even more necessary to take comparable action to raise the standards of indigenous schools, to avoid putting the refugees in the invidious position of being a privileged group in the host community.

(b) Baluchistan

26. Baluchistan is the largest, most sparsely populated and least developed of the constituent provinces of Pakistan. It has a long border with Afghanistan which can be crossed easily at many points, with the result that frequently quite small groups of refugees are scattered throughout the border districts, often in locations remote from any of the indigenous population. This is a significant difference from the situation in the Northwest Frontier Province, where indigenes and refugees frequently coexist in close proximity and utilize many of the same facilities. Because of the difficulties of distance and limited communications, it is more difficult to cater to refugee needs in Baluchistan, so that in quantitative terms less has been done.

./...

27. As yet the provincial government has not created any special machinery to handle refugee education comparable to the Education Cell in Peshawar. However there have recently been appointed three new Assistant District Education Officers with special responsibility for the education of refugees in Pishin, Zhob/Loralai and Chagai districts, where most refugees are to be found. These report to their respective District Education Officers who in turn report to the Education Department in Quetta. UNHCR will furnish these officials with transport.

28. UNHCR is the agency mainly concerned with financing education for refugees in Baluchistan. In 1980 36 tented primary schools were established and 3 more have recently been added. Enrolments in the original 36 schools totalled only 3,181 in 1981, estimated to be only 28% of the relevant age group, and all boys. This apparent lack of success in attracting students is no doubt in part a function of their scattered distribution, but other considerations are also relevant. In particular the tents being used for schools are the normal residential tents, which are too small to be suitable for education. They can hold only a few students in comfort, and are too dark. In one case the school's tent has been stolen and it is obliged to function in a roofless mud building. Apart from providing the tents and paying the teachers, the UNHCR also provides an equipment package for each school. This includes mats, furniture for the teacher, writing equipment, religious books, blackboards, storage chest, sports equipment, water jugs and utensils. In some ways this is a more comprehensive package than is available in Northwest Frontier province, with the notable exception of textbooks. However in the schools visited many students had the Pushtu books produced by the Textbook Development Board in Peshawar.

29. Since it is generally recognized that the existing tents are unsatisfactory, UNHCR has made provision for the building of 18 2-classroom katcha schools (mud walls, wood beams and corrugated sheet roofs) costing 35,000 rupees each, to replace some of the tented schools. At the same time 35 tents are to be procured to permit the opening of further schools. The total UNHCR budget for education in Baluchistan in 1981 is 1,736,372

./...

Pak. rupees (US$175,000 approx.), the main items of expenditure being school construction and teachers' salaries.

30. The only other organization which has so far done anything on behalf of refugee education in Baluchistan is Inter-Aid Committee, a Catholic relief body. This agency has supplied over 30,000 textbooks in both Pushtu and Urdu, covering all the grades and subjects of primary education. In the main the books appear on casual inspection to be those produced by the Textbook Development Board in Peshawar. At the time of the mission these books were lying in the District Education Office in Quetta, along with a variety of other equipment and furniture supplied by the Inter-Aid Committee, awaiting distribution to the schools. This agency has also expressed a wish to do something for the secondary education of the refugees, depending on the extent of demand.

31. The Baluchistan provincial authorities have been active in establishing 5 carpet-weaving centres for boys in various camps, with financing from UNHCR. In 1981 a total of 261 children have been enrolled in these centres. Many of the boys participating have previously received some primary education, but it would be desirable to integrate this type of practical training more closely with schooling, to which it could form a complement. The marketing of the products of these centres is undertaken through the Small Industries Development Board, and it is intended that they should in this way become self-supporting.

32. Mainly through the initiative of the wife of the Chief Secretary of the Provincial Government, a scheme has been initiated for the production of embroidery by refugee women, working within their tents. An infra-structure is needed to supply them with the raw materials and to collect the finished products, and a further problem not yet resolved is that of marketing, for there is no local point of sale for the high-quality items being produced.

./...

33. One Vocational Training Centre for refugees has been constructed at Kila Abdullah in Pishin district and a second is proposed at Mohd.Kheil. The necessary machinery is in the process of being delivered, but it is not yet clear who will provide the training, or how the trainees are to be used afterward. The trades to be taught include motor mechanics and carpentry. There is a further proposal under German auspices to open another such training centre in Loralai district, which could also be used by refugees.

34. With the exception of the carpet-weaving and embroidery schemes, which appear to be functioning effectively, there is only limited progress in providing education or training to the refugees in Baluchistan. Undoubtedly this is at least partly due to the unresponsiveness of the refugees themselves, which in turn is a function of their unsettled situation and in some instances a preference for religious education. But there is also a need for the provincial authorities to be more active in organizing and supervising the delivery of education services to the refugees. In this respect the recent appointment of Assistant District Education Officers responsible for refugee education is a useful first step, but on its own not enough. A structure akin to the Education Cell in the Northwest Frontier Province, and under active leadership, is also needed. However, this will be more difficult to establish in Baluchistan, because there is a limited local availability of qualified manpower which could take on such a task.

35. In addition, some basic decisions still have to be taken with regard to refugee education in the province. There is no agreement among provincial officials as to whether the refugees want to be educated in Pushtu or Urdu, so what should be the respective roles of these two languages in their education.

./...

IV. The Educational Situation of Northwest Frontier and Baluchistan provinces

36. In preparing recommendations for the education of refugees, one factor which must always be kept in mind is the degree of deprivation of the host communities. However willing these are to accept the presence of refugees, this willingness will rapidly be diminished if it appears that the refugees are receiving preferential treatment which puts them into a privileged position giving them a competitive edge over their hosts. In the Pakistan situation this consideration is particularly important in the Northwest Frontier, where refugees and host communities are closely intermingled and often sharing the same facilities. In Baluchistan, where the majority of refugees are relatively isolated, it is potentially of less significance, though it should nevertheless not be ignored.

37. The Federally Administered Tribal Areas within the Northwest Frontier Province are the main area of concentration of the refugees, so that it is the educational situation within this region which is of primary concern for present purposes. Primary enrolments in 1981 were stated to be 40,298 boys and 2,848 girls, equivalent to gross enrolment ratios of 25% and 1.9% respectively. These students are scattered through 1,062 boys' schools and 134 girls' schools, which indicates an average enrolment of 38 pupils in boys' schools and under 14 in girls' schools. The drop-out rates are stated to be 50% among boys and 65% among girls. Of the 1,196 primary schools, 328 have no proper buildings, 58 are located in private housing not designed for use as a school, and 458 are in schoolbuildings in urgent need of repair. Only some 30% of the schools are thus considered to be adequately housed.

./...

38. There is no system for providing food to the children during the six to seven hours they are supposed to be in school, which reduces their attention span, and similarly many children lack adequate clothing for the cold winter months. (In comparison it may be noted that refugees receive regular allowances in cash and kind, including bedding, clothing, basic rations, utensils and their tent). Although there is an adequate number of teachers (P/T ratio 23/1 in boys' schools and 10.6/1 in girls' schools) their attitudes and teaching methods are considered to be over-authoritarian and out-dated and there are not the facilities to ensure regular supervision of the frequently remote schools.

39. Adult education activities are just beginning and as yet reach only a few hundred people in a number of very small centres. Similarly secondary education is as yet little developed.

40. In Baluchistan the education system is less developed than in other provinces of Pakistan, with only some 54% of the correct age group enrolled in primary schools for boys, and 14% in girls' schools. Emphasis is initially being put on the development of religious education for girls, which can then be broadened to include other subjects. A particular problem is the quality of teachers, for since 1971 the province has refused to accept teachers from other provinces, and it has only a limited teacher training capacity of its own. Another problem about the expansion of education for girls is the difficulty of finding female teachers who are prepared to teach outside the main urban centres, even when housing is provided for them. Given these problems, it is difficult to believe that the province will be able to realize its goals of universal primary education for boys in 1986/7, and for girls in 1991/2.

./...

V. Recommendations for Refugee Education

41. In making proposals for the education of the refugees in Pakistan, account must be taken of the particular characteristics of the refugee group, of the educational provisions which have already been made for them, and of the educational situation of the host population in the refugee reception areas. Each of these factors has been described in some detail in the preceding sections.

42. Given the implications of these factors, there is little point in trying to produce a comprehensive blueprint of an ideal educational provision for the refugees. There are unlikely to be the resources available for such an enterprise, it would unduly favour the refugees over their hosts, and it is to be hoped that the refugees would have been able to return to their homes before such an effort could be fully implemented. Instead the approach adopted in the following proposals is to try to fill some of the gaps in what is already being done, to try to remove some short-comings which have appeared in the existing provisions, and at the same time to try not to treat the refugees in isolation from the Pakistanis around them. The underlying objective in this approach is the amelioration of what is hopefully a temporary situation.

(a) The Approach Proposed

43. Given that the ultimate aim is that the refugees should return to their place of origin, in preference to remaining in Pakistan or going on to a third country, then any proposals for their education and training should be conceived in the light of improving their resettlement prospects and capacity to raise their own standard of living once back in their own country. Moreover, to the maximum extent possible, the education and training of the refugees should be seen as a self-help venture, using the talents and experience available among them, and hopefully thereby helping to ensure their active support for the measures adopted.

./...

44. In the light of these considerations, it is suggested that something more than a traditional system of formal education needs to be offered to the refugees. At the same time, bearing in mind the relative deprivation of some of the host communities, it is also desirable that parallel measures should be initiated for these latter groups too, in order to prevent the emergence of a privileged group of refugees.

45. Accordingly, the recommendations which follow may be divided into two groups, (i) those relating to formal education, and (ii) those relating to training and non-formal activities. These two groups of recommendations are brought together through being centred on a common delivery point, which may be described as a "community centre for refugee education and training".

(b) <u>The Community Centre Concept</u>

46. So far the main emphasis of efforts to assist the education of the refugees has been on the provision of primary education in tented schools. The refugee response to this endeavour has been limited, in that enrolments have remained moderate. Moreover, this effort reaches only one small segment of the refugees, namely boys in the approximate age-range for primary school, and it does not provide them with any marketable skills in the short run.

47. Since the refugees mostly have little previous exposure to education and training activities, the first task is to arouse their interest and appreciation of the potential advantages of education and training. To do this, it is necessary to have a delivery system and an information package, to which the refugees can be introduced. Therefore it is <u>recommended that in each refugee camp there should be erected a community centre</u>, which would serve simultaneously as primary school, women's centre, and an adult training unit. This could be a mud-walled building with corrugated iron roof, similar to the construction materials and methods now being employed in the erection of katcha schools in Baluchistan,

./...

using refugee labour. A two-roomed structure of this type would provide two classrooms for primary education, which could alternately be used as meeting rooms for men and women, and for training purposes. It may be noted that the refugees have spontaneously constructed buildings using similar materials to serve as mosques in their camps.

48. In Baluchistan the cost of this type of building for use as a school is about US$3,500, but the rooms are small for adult use. A slight enlargement would increase the construction cost to the order of US$4,000, and to this should be added US$1,500 for furnishings and equipment as follows :

(i) the equipment package UNHCR provides for the Baluchistan primary schools, together with additional visual aids, maps, etc.

(ii) for women's community activities, information materials on child welfare, food preparation, personal hygiene, sewing, weaving, and poultry-keeping, together with a limited amount of demonstration equipment and utensils, and

(iii) for men's activities, materials on animal husbandry, land and tree conservation, environmental hygiene, irrigation and water control, and appropriate crops and garden products.

49. The furnishings provided should include lockable cupboards for storage of the equipment, an instructor's desk and chair for each room, floor mats, wooden attachments along the walls for handing demonstration materials, and blackboards.

50. The staff of the centre would in the first instance be primary teachers, but would also be required to act as

./...

THE EDUCATIONAL NEEDS OF REFUGEES IN PAKISTAN

I. Introduction

1. At the twenty-first session of the General Conference of Unesco, in September-October 1980, resolution 7/05 "Assistance for refugees in Asia" noted the increasing significance of Asian refugee problems within the overall world refugee situation. The resolution invited the Director-General of Unesco to provide assistance to Asian refugees to the extent possible and in co-operation with other concerned organizations, e.g. UNHCR, UNICEF, in particular in fields such as education.

2. It is in this context that a mission was undertaken on behalf of Unesco to ascertain the educational needs of refugees in Pakistan. The terms of reference of the mission were as follows :

(a) Assess the educational needs of refugees in Pakistan and formulate recommendations for a suitable educational structure for them

(b) Assess refugee needs in classrooms and school materials

(c) Assess the adequacy of available teaching staff and indicate teacher training needs

(d) Indicate priority educational needs of various groups of refugees, e.g. children, women, adults and youths and make recommendations on how their needs can be met

(e) Suggest suitable curricula for refugee groups in (d) above and indicate language needs.

(f) Make recommendations on work-orientated education programmes for relevant groups of the refugee community in consultation with the International Labour Organization, the UNHCR, and relevant

./...

discussion leaders for men's activities (appropriate training for this role will have to be given), and eventually as adult educators, with the necessary supplements in pay. Initially these efforts could be expected to yield only limited results in terms of transfers of knowledge, but their most important potential benefit would be the development among the participants of the concept of activity for social and self-improvement, leading to a demand for more extented training.

51. The most difficult part of the proposed design to implement will be the community activities for women, because traditionally they remain within their homes, and also because it will be necessary to seek discussion leaders and animators from among the women themselves, and very few have any kind of appropriate educational background. Nevertheless a serious effort should be made, in order to realize the potential benefits to family welfare.

52. It is very important that the community centres should not come to be seen as the location of secular activities in opposition to the mosques. To avoid this possibility their should be an element of religious instruction in all the activities carried on in the centres.

53. The costs of building and equipping a community centre are estimated above to be US$5,500. Therefore, for US$1.1 million, 200 centres could be erected and equipped. Of these, 160 could be allocated to the Northwest Frontier Province, in particular the FATA areas, and the remainder to Baluchistan, thus roughly reflecting the distribution of the refugees between the two provinces.

54. In addition, bearing in mind the impoverishment of the host populations and the need to avoid making the refugees a privileged enclove, it is recommended that a sum of money be allocated for the creation of similar facilities for the local population. Wherever possible this could be done

./...

through repairing and upgrading the local Pakistani school to perform a community centre role. It is suggested that US$500,000 be allocated for this purpose, most of it to be spent in the FATA areas where refugees and indigenes are most closely intermingled. Again the labour required should be provided mainly by the community.

(c) Recommendations for Formal Education

55. (i) Primary Education

Since the language of the great majority of the refugees is Pushtu, it would be simplest to use this as the medium of instruction. Where a group of refugees express the wish to also have Urdu instruction for their children, the Pakistan authorities should be encouraged to provide appropriate teachers, to be paid out of the funds for refugee assistance, and not from government funds. Since it is not desirable to encourage among the refugees the idea of staying in Pakistan, it would be best not to make Urdu a compulsory subject. There are some groups of refugees speaking Dari (Persian) or other languages, and where possible these should be provided with instruction in their own language, subject to the availability of teachers and materials.

56. Currently the primary education being offered to the refugees in their own schools includes Religious Studies, Pushtu and Mathematics in the lower grades, with the addition of Arabic, Dari, Geography, History and General Science from the fourth grade onwards. While the attention to three basic subjects during the first three grades seems appropriate, too many additional subjects are being added in the later years. Two curriculum changes are suggested. In the earlier years, in order to broaden the interests of the students, it would be desirable to add a course, which might be called Social Studies or General Studies, intended primarily to improve their general knowledge of the world around them. Secondly it is suggested that the subject load in the later years should be reduced, but that efforts should be made to teach the remaining subjects more intensively, e.g. geography and history could be combined

./...

in a Social Affairs course, and language teaching should be restricted to the mother tongue, with Urdu made an optional additional subject in these years. This would then be very similar to the curriculum proposed for use in the schools under UNHCR auspices.

57. As was indicated earlier, the refugees at present are using textbooks prepared by themselves or from the Textbook Development Board in Peshawar. It is recommended that specialists from both the Board and the Refugee Education Bureau be brought together to prepare improved textbooks for primary education, specifically conceived to meet the particular needs of the refugee children. The staff of the Unesco Regional Office in Bangkok, who have experience in a similar exercise for the Kampuchean refugees in Thailand, could play a valuable consultative role in this endeavour and the Unesco Regional Office for Book Development in Karachi may also be able to help. The Pushtu Academy of Peshawar University also has experience of book production for children and newly literate adults. An additional necessary input for textbook production is paper. It is suggested that US$200,000 be allocated to textbook preparation and production to cover costs of honoraria and travel for the preparation work supply of paper and printing.

58. Both for reasons of the desirability of stimulating a self-help ethos, and to minimize the language barrier, it is preferable that as far as possible the refugees should be taught by teachers from their own community. Many of those currently teaching in the refugee schools claim to have been trained as teachers, though they have no documents to substantiate the claim. In any case, with the introduction of the community centre concept proposed above, there will be a need to train primary teachers to play a broader role. Therefore it is recommended that teacher-training courses for refugee teachers be introduced. The principal contents of such training courses should include teaching methods and lesson-planning, the special problems of teaching in a multi-grade situation, the community leadership role of the teacher,

./...

and eventually adult education. Again, the experience gained by the Unesco Regional Office in Bangkok in training Kampuchean refugee teachers in Thailand could very well be applied in Pakistan. Some of the training materials developed in the Thailand situation may be usable also in Pakistan, with modifications as necessary.

59. Initially such training should be provided for the existing refugee teachers, but eventually it may also be feasible to offer courses to newly-recruited teachers for future schools. In order to minimize disruption of existing refugee education, the initial training courses at least should take the form of vacation courses, to be held during the long school vacation on a residential basis in teacher-training colleges. The Baluchistan provincial authorities have indicated that Sibi Teacher Training College could be used for this purpose. An equivalent institution will have to be located in the Northwest Frontier Province by the Refugee Education Cell in Peshawar.

60. Apart from possibly drawing on personnel from the Unesco Regional Office in Bangkok, in particular for preparing detailed course content, the teacher-trainers could be selected from both qualified refugees and Pakistani sources. Such a mixed faculty would be desirable in order to minimize language problems, since it is preferable that as far as possible the training should be given in Pushtu.

61. The principal costs of teacher-training courses organized along the above lines would be for preparation of course materials, travel and honoraria of faculty, and travel and residence costs of trainees, and possibly in some instances of their families, where these could not be left on their own in the camps. It is assumed that the teachers receiving the training would continue to receive their normal salaries, which should therefore not be included in the costs of training. An expenditure of US$100,000 is proposed to cover the costs of providing training to the existing refugee teachers.

./...

62. There needs to be improved supervision of existing primary education activities. In particular, it is recommended that in Baluchistan an Education Cell for Refugees, similar to that now operating in Peshawar, should be created. It could be designed along similar lines though slightly smaller, and should have three subordinate offices, for Chagai, Pishin and Zhob districts, of which the recently-appointed Assistant District Education Officers could become the nuclei. In addition two jeeps should be provided to the provincial cell, to supplement the motor-cycles already supplied at the district level. Costs of these proposals initially would be approximately as follows (1981 prices) :

Provincial education cell, salaries,	180,000 Pak. rupees
3 district offices, salaries,	150,000 " "
Office equipment	200,000 " "
2 jeeps (duty-free)	176,000 " "
Fuel and maintenance for transport	60,000 " "
Total	766,000 Pak. rupees
	(say US$80,000 approx.)

In subsequent years the recurrent costs (salaries, fuel and maintenance) would be reduced to 390,000 Pak. rupees per annum (US$40,000 approx.)

63. Once such machinery had been established it would be possible to operate refugee education facilities in Baluchistan in a similar way to that now being evolved in the Northwest Frontier Province. A further desirable step in this context would be the organization of a short training course in educational supervision, stressing its positive aspects as a service for improving teacher performance rather than the negative "policing" role traditionally associated with supervision. Such a course should be attended by the staffs of the two Education Cells and their local offices, as well as leading educationists among the refugees. The best location for such a course would be

./...

Peshawar, since it has the highest concentration of potential trainees, hence reducing travelling costs. A Unesco specialist in educational supervision should be course director, with faculty inputs from Pakistani sources. Costs of a 2-week course, including international and national travel, should be under US$10,000, so this amount is proposed to cover all eventualities.

64. (ii) Secondary Education

A number of the better-educated refugees are now enrolled in Pakistani secondary schools. There have been several proposals aired for the provision of secondary education facilities for the refugees. Any such provision would be a relatively expensive matter, because the dispension of the refugees implies that the relatively few qualified for secondary schools would have to be brought together at some central location, which in turn would involve the establishment of boarding facilities. Therefore, until such time as it has been established through surveys that substantial numbers of refugees qualify for secondary education and they are sufficiently concentrated to permit the creation of day facilities, it is recommended that the present ad hoc system of provision should continue. However, since there is evidence that the refugee enrolments are straining already overcrowded facilities in some secondary institutions, particularly in the Peshawar area, it is further recommended that a fund of US$100,000 should be established which could be used to relieve such overcrowding in specific instances, e.g. by construction of an extra classroom or laboratory, or extension of dormitory facilities. Such operations could be carried out through the respective provincial Education Cells, in consultation with Unesco or UNHCR.

65. (iii) Vocational Education

Some initiatives have already been taken to provide vocational education or training facilities for refugees.

./...

Until surveys to clearly establish the skill needs and capacities of the refugees have been undertaken, these initiatives may be premature. It is very important that any such training offered should closely relate to the priority needs of the refugees, and also that it should be of adequate quality to ensure that they can afterwards function without close supervision beyond an initial period, i.e. as independent workers. In the interim, several possibilities of absorbing refugees in existing vocational training activities in Pakistan are available, as follows. Some of the vocational training institutions in and around Peshawar have vacant places, and these could be filled by refugees, subject to the agreement of the Pakistani authorities. The ILO Vocational Training Project in Pakistan is establishing Centres for Apprenticeship Training throughout the country, and in principle some places could be reserved in the Centres in Baluchistan and Northwest Frontier Province for refugees. The programme involves one year at a Centre, followed by a year in industry, before sitting for a trade test. To facilitate refugee participation, the Pakistani authorities would have to assist the placing of refugee trainees in industry. Another ILO programme in Pakistan, the Asian and Pacific Skills Development Programme, based in Islamabad, would be prepared to assist with the translation of training materials for refugee use, and also with the planning and monitoring of training courses. Finally the UNICEF Office in Quetta expects to begin training courses in mid-1982, of two years' duration, in transport maintenance and the servicing of water-supply systems. They would be prepared to reserve a few training places for refugees. It is recommended that a fund of US$25,000 be established on a recurrent basis to provide fellowships for refugee vocational training students. At 5,000 rupees p.a. per student (UNHCR reckons 6,600 rupess p.a. for refugee university scholarships in Pakistan), this would allow for 50 fellowships. In the record year of operation, assuming most training courses are for two years, the costs would rise to US$50,000 to cover the record intake, but thereafter would remain at the same level.

./...

66. Higher Education

Since UNHCR already has a project to provide scholarships for refugees attending Pakistani institutions of higher education, it is not suggested that Unesco should take action in this direction. However the appropriate services of Unesco might eventually be called on to assist in the placement of refugees requiring further specialized or post graduate education in institutions overseas.

67 (d) Recommendations for Non-Formal Education and Training

From the viewpoint of enhancing the capacity of the refugees to eventually resettle successfully in their own country, and also as a means for reducing their disruptive influence on their hosts in Pakistan, the recommendations under this heading are potentially even more important than those for formal education, though they may also be more difficult to implement. Some of the proposals made in the following paragraphs may fall outside the areas of normal concern of Unesco, but there is a strong possibility they may be taken up by other concerned agencies in the U.N. system or elsewhere.

68. The two main problems created by the refugees in the reception areas in Pakistan, and which impinge adversely on their relations with the host populations, derive from over-grazing of the sparse pastures by the refugees' animals, and exhaustion of indigenous fuel resources, in particular firewood, as the refugees chop down the remaining trees. These are two aspects of a single basic situation, namely that the border areas of Pakistan are a precarious arid or semi-arid environment, which is unable to absorb this extra burden of uncontrolled exploitation without serious and possibly irreversible disruption. Short of putting the refugees into closely delineated camp areas and depriving them of their animals and traditional way of live, steps need to be taken to ameliorate the environmental situation within which the refugees are living. In particular the refugees themselves should be actively involved in such steps which would have two priority objectives : (i) the restoration of damaged

./...

areas for future use by the local populations, and (ii) training the refugees to preserve the ecology and environment within which they pursue their traditional pattern of life, while at the same time teaching them how to improve the standard of living so derived.

69. It is recommended that pilot schemes of land conservation and improvement, using refugee labour inputs should be initiated. This could most easily be undertaken on areas of government land, or alternatively on a contract basis with private landowners. It would probably be much more difficult to organize such schemes on tribally-owned land, though in such cases the possibility of organizing parallel schemes for the indigenous populations should be investigaged. The types of activities to be undertaken in areas selected for such a scheme would include range management, soil conservation, irrigation control and reforestation and woodland management. The refugees selected to participate in such a scheme, ideally those with an agricultural or pastoral background, would have to be settled in the chosen area, and then closely supervised in carrying out the types of activities listed above, while of course being paid for their work. Such a project would of course take a number of years to carry out, but the possibility that the refugees might be repatriated beforehand should not be considered an obstacle, but rather an opportunity to replace them with members of the local population. On completion of this type of project by the refugees, it is essential that the rehabilitated land should then be turned over to the indigenous population for settlement, or returned to its owner in the case of private land, and not left for exploitation by the refugees, risking giving the impression that they are being settled in Pakistan. Under this conception the refugees would play the role of a land development service, arresting land deterioration (and hopefully making their presence thereby more acceptable to the local population) and at the same time learning how to better manage their own lands following their eventual repatriation.

./...

70. In order to explore further the feasibility of this proposal, and with a view to persuading all parties concerned to pursue the idea further, it is suggested that an inter-agency mission should be mounted as soon as possible to carry out the detailed preparation and costing of such a project on the ground. On the international side leadership of the mission could be entrusted to either UNHCR or ILO, and membership of the mission should include ILO for labour-intensive public works, FAO for range management, afforestation and soil conservation, UNICEF for water supply (they already have an important programme in the refugee areas), and UNESCO for any eventual adult education component. Other agencies might be invited to participate as deemed necessary. From the Pakistani side representatives of appropriate ministries at both federal and provincial levels should be sought. If this conception is accepted in principle then it would also be desirable in the interests of parity if parallel projects for indigenous population groups could also be developed, with the difference that they could eventually take over the land they had rehabilitated.

71. Under the earlier discussion of the community centre concept and its associated activities, and in the recommendations for formal education, reference was made to the types of activities, the training of teachers as community animators, and the need to provide information materials and a limited amount of equipment. These points will not be reiterated here, except to suggest the possibility of a joint UNHCR/ILO mission, of necessity with female staffing, to investigate in more detail how to activate the women's component of the community centre concept. Such a mission would need to pursue this matter at the levels of both refugee leaders and the female refugees themselves, together with Pakistani women's organizations.

./...

national and refugee authorities

(g) Ensure that proposals made to Unesco are original and feasible and do not duplicate any activities already being implemented by other agencies and/or voluntary organizations.

(h) Explore possibilities of Unesco's co-operation with other agencies and voluntary organizations engaged in refugee education projects in implementing the proposals.

3. The influx of refugees into Pakistan is by now estimated by UNHCR to be the largest single refugee flow in the world. At the time of the mission (September 1981), the Pakistani authorities were making a first systematic effort to enumerate and record the composition of the refugee population. Hitherto they had limited themselves to registering newly arriving refugees, a procedure which is subject to various possibilities of abuse, e.g. avoidance of registration, double registration to draw extra rations which can then be sold for cash, and failure to cancel the registrations of any refugees who may have moved on to other countries. The latest available figures for registered refugees were as follows :

North-West Frontier Province (including Federally administered Tribal Areas - F.A.T.A.) 1 September 1981

Men	Women	Children	Total
467,000	535,000	797,000	1,799,000

Baluchistan - 1 June 1981

Men	Women	Children	Total
100,000	105,000	222,500	427,500

Note : data supplied by the respective Provincial Commissioners for Refugees.

./...

An important contact point for such a mission would be Mrs. Helga Ahmad, wife of the Chief Secretary of the Baluchistan Provincial Government, who has initiated what appears so far to be the only activity for refugee women, namely the embroidery scheme referred to earlier.

72. Reference has been made to the various carpet-weaving activities which have been initiated with different groups of refugees, some of which appear to be in the process of becoming self-sustaining operations. It need only be added that, to the extent that the trainees are juveniles, it is highly desirable that their training should be amalgamated with primary education.

73. Until further information is available on the skills existing among the refugees it is difficult to make additional recommendations on their needs for non-formal training. The Small Industries Development Board in the Northwest Frontier provincial government is preparing to carry out such a survey of refugee skills, in cooperation with the Planning and Development Department in the province. The Rural Employment branch of ILO, Geneva, has experience of carrying out such surveys among refugees in Africa, and it is recommended that their expertise might usefully be called on, possibly through UNHCR, by the provincial authorities. Assistance could be given in particular with the design of the inquiry, and with interpretation of the results.

(e) Conclusion

74. Under the earlier recommendations for formal education, some approximate cost estimates were given for the various items. These may be consolidated as follows

./...

(at 1981 prices in US$) :

1.	Establishment of community centres for refugees	1,100,000
2.	Refurnishment and equipment of Pakistani schools to serve the same purpose	500,000
3.	Curriculum improvement and textbook production	200,000
4.	Teacher-training	100,000
5.	Establishment of Education Cell, Baluchistan	80,000
6.	Educational supervision training course	10,000
7.	Secondary education	100,000
8.	Vocational education (when fully operating)	50,000
	TOTAL	$2,140,000

75. This total of $2,140,000 represents a target to aim at for financing of refugee education activities under UNESCO auspices. It would permit the achievement of a greatly improved provision of educational services for the refugees while simultaneously giving some attention to the needs of the host populations. It is far from representing an ideal provision, which it was suggested was for various reasons not feasible. The objective here is the limited one of amelioration of the situation, not the realization of an optimal solution.

In addition there are known to be other unregistered refugees living in the cities of these two provinces, and also small numbers in the other provinces of Pakistan. Also there is a continuing though intermittent flow of new refugees.

4. On the basis of these admittedly imprecise statistics, it appears reasonable to estimate the refugee population as being from 2 to 2½ millions as of September 1981. Of this total about half were categorised as children, even though in a population without birth registration "child" is an imprecise concept. Nevertheless it would be reasonable to assume that the refugee population in Pakistan contains a minimum of 500,000 children of school-going age. This alone implies a considerable educational need, without considering the further needs of adults and young people for training and/or basic education of various kinds. However, in arriving at a balanced assessment of the refugees' educational needs, and in particular of the priorities for action, other qualitative factors must be taken into consideration, as discussed in the following sections.

II. Characteristics of the Refugee Population in Pakistan

(a) The Economic Background

5. The vast majority of the refugees come from rural areas and are of an agricultural or pastoral background. In addition many of them have been accustomed to follow a nomadic or semi-nomadic way of life, and they have brought large numbers of animals with them to Pakistan. The number of additional grazing animals thus added to the heavily used border pastoral areas of Pakistan is estimated to be over three millions, of which perhaps half are in Baluchistan. In the areas in which the refugees have arrived they are having a potentially serious impact on what is already a precarious ecological situation, where the limited pasturage is fully utilized by the indigenous populations in an established process of rotation. This

./...

additional burden on the limited pastoral resources of the border regions will in turn hurt the economic interests of the local people, with the risk of making them hostile towards the refugees. Conversely, to the extent that the refugees are unable to carry on their traditional agricultural activities and instead have to subsist on relief supplies, they risk losing economic motivation and becoming prey to boredom and unrest, which will in turn make their eventual resettlement more difficult.

6. Similar problems are arising, due to the impact of refugee arrivals, with regard to water and fuel supplies. The reception areas are in general arid, and the rapid arrival of a substantial additional population necessitates the establishment of new sources of water supply. Similarly the demand of the refugees for firewood. in particular for cooking, means that the sparse local timber supplies are rapidly being depleted to the point of exhaustion.

7. These economic implications of the refugees'influx must be born in mind when making recommendations for educational provision. A minority of the refugees are from a more sophisticated urban background and these have in some instances set themselves up in business in Pakistan, e.g. in road haulage or trading, where they compete with indigenous enterprises. The implications of this aspect of refugee economic life must also be considered in making educational proposals for the refugees.

(b) Social Structure

8. The refugees in general are members of particular tribal groups, which are very similar in structure, and sometimes closely related to the tribal societies characteristic of the border areas of Pakistan. The distinctive features of these social groupings have been described and analysed by anthropologists [1], and it is not proposed here to do more

---

1) For a recent concise summary see Ahmed, Akbar S. Social and Economic Change in the Tribal Areas. Karachi, O.U.P. 1977

./...

than single out particular features judged most relevant for the purposes of this report.

9. An entire tribe traces its descendant from a single ancestor, but this does not imply that there is a pyramidal structure of authority. Instead each segment or sub-segment of the tribe, which may be no more than a single extended family, looks to its own head or elder as its authority, and all such family heads are equally important within the tribe except in rare instances where a particularly talented individual may establish a personal stature leading to wider leadership. Decisions to commit the tribe to any particular course of action are taken only after a sometimes lengthy process of consultation among the elders and fellowing their agreement. The implication of this system of tribal organization is that the establishment of any innovatory social policy among the group must be preceded by a carefully propared consultative process to ensure its acceptance and successful implementation. Failure to follow this sometimes tortuous procedure can lead to a check, as in the case of a school for refugee girls in Baluchistan, which was established on the basis of parental interest but had to be abandoned when the tribal elders opposed it.

10. The tribal societies, function according to strict moral codes, the infringement of which leads to severe sanctions, and frequently to inter-or intra-tribal feuds which may continue for generations, and prevent even related groups from co-existing peaceably together. In the confusion of the refugee influx into Pakistan, there have been instances of such feuding groups being thrown together, leading to disturbances, and preventing the provision of assistance accessible to all.

11. A further consequence of the segmented nature of the tribal societies is that they tend to settle and move in small groups. This pattern is reflected among the refugees, where the different groups often prefer to keep to themselves, making more difficult the provision of social services.

./...

(c) The Role of Religion

12. The refugees are strict Muslims, mostly Sunnis, but with a minority of Shias. They give precedence to the religious over the secular life, and in this context give priority to religious education. Moreover, the tribesmen have traditionally kept their womenfolk in strict seclusion, and limited their participation in economic life to those activities which could be undertaken within the confinement of the home. It is noteworthy that in the tented encampments which have been created for the refugees, nearly every tent has been surrounded by a high mud wall to preserve family seclusion. In this climate the possibilities for providing any form of education or training for women or girls appear strictly limited. It is widely believed in Pakistan that one of the reasons the refugees came was to escape the imminent prospect of compulsory female education.

(d) Previous Exposure to Social Services

13. The refugees have very little previous exposure to social services, in particular education. According to the UNHCR Representative for Pakistan, the illiteracy rate among the refugees is at least 90% for males and 98% for females. The education of girls is almost unheard of. Indeed, the majority of refugees come from a milieu in which they were almost untouched by government services, so that it is more difficult to organize them to fit into their Pakistani surroundings without inconveniencing their hosts more than necessary.

14. In this context it is unfortunate that the largest single concentration of refugees is located in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) adjacent to the Northwest Frontier Province. Traditionally these areas, while subject to a limited political administration, were to a large extent self-governing and received a minimal provision of public services. In recent years the Pakistan authorities have made considerable efforts to introduce a wide range of facilities, and after initial doubts were overcome these have been received enthusiastically, though there is still far to go to catch up with other areas of the country.

./...

The imposition of the refugees on an already stretched situation where the absorptive capacity is least makes it particularly difficult to cater to refugee needs, which will thus compete with local demands.

(e) Conclusion

15. From the foregoing remarks it is clear that the task of meeting the educational needs of the refugees is far from simple and straightforward. Their relative previous lack of educational facilities might suggest that anything that can be made available would be beneficial, but the various constraints identified in the foregoing paragraphs suggest that no such simple prescription would be adequate. Rather a carefully designed educational package is required to meet the refugees' specific educational needs while at the same time responding to their absorptive capacity. With this general principle in mind it is necessary also to take account of the provisions which have already been made by the national and provincial authorities and international and voluntary agencies to meet the educational needs of the refugees.

III. Existing Educational Provision for the Refugees in Pakistan

16. It is useful to discuss separately the educational facilities provided for refugees in Northwest Frontier Province (including FATA), and those provided in Baluchistan. As might be expected, given the greater concentration of refugees, more has been done in the Northwest Frontier, but a greater variety of initiatives has been started in Baluchistan, where the refugees are both fewer and more scattered over a larger area.

17. Under the constitution of Pakistan, education is a provincial responsibility, so that it is the respective provincial governments which have been most involved in providing education facilities for the refugees. Hitherto the main source of finance for these programmes has been funds provided by UNHCR.

./...

(a) Northwest Frontier Province

18. The provincial authorities have established a new Education Cell (unit) for Refugees, headed by an Additional Commissioner for Education who is responsible to both the provincial Education Department and the Provincial Commissioner for Refugees. The Education Cell is physically located in the offices of the Commissioner for Refugees. To assist him the Additional Commissioner for Education has six Assistant Commissioners. Two of these are posted with him in Peshawar, responsible respectively for general administration and supervision, and the remainder are posted to centres throughout the province, where they are responsible for refugee education in the local districts and tribal agencies.

19. In collaboration with UNHCR a programme to establish 250 primary schools for 25,000 male refugees has been started. On 1st July 1981, 51 of these schools were already operating. Among this group the average school had 119 pupils, 1.86 teachers, and a pupil/teacher ratio of 64 to 1. These schools are established in large tents, within which several different grades of pupils sit in separate groups. In one of the schools visited canvas partitions had been erected between the groups, but this appeared to be exceptional, and made little difference to the level of conflicting noise. The children sit on mats on the ground, and the schools otherwise are provided with a minimum of equipment - a blackboard (often broken), tables and chairs for the teachers, a steel box for storage, and water jugs. In the few schools which could be visited the children were generally provided with textbooks and uniforms and these items are included in the UNHCR programme of assistance. Most children also managed to have their own writing materials.

20. The curriculum for these schools has been prepared in consultation with the refugees to reflect their felt needs, and concentrates on Pushtu, Religious Studies and Mathematics, taught by refugee teachers. In addition courses in Urdu and

./...

Social Studies given by Pakistani teachers are included wherever possible. Pushtu-language textbooks based on those in use in Afghanistan have been prepared by the Hezb-i-Islami Refugee Education Bureau and are in wide use. In addition the provincial Textbook Development Board in Peshawar has produced Pushtu-language textbooks for local use, which are also being used in the refugee schools. The limited assessment possible across the language barrier suggests that the latter are better adapted to the needs of young children.

21. Apart from supplying the inputs to establish the schools described above, the UNHCR education budget for the province in 1981 also provides for the salaries, office equipment and transport of the Education Cell for Refugees, and for teachers' salaries and school operating expenses. The total UNHCR budget for education in 1981 in the province is fixed at Pak.rupees 14,743,480 (US$ 1.5 million approx.). For 1982 the budget is expected to be reduced to Pak.rupees 7,683,004 (US$780,000 approx.), representing mainly the operating costs of the schools and administrative units established in 1981.

22. In addition to the above facilities, the refugees themselves have established another 128 essentially religious schools. These are progressively being taken over by the Education Cell and adapted to their programme, including payment of the teachers at the usual rates (400-500 rupees per month). A most important point which could not be clarified is the extent to which these takeovers are being classified as new schools under the UNHCR-financed programme. UNHCR estimates that there are some 15,000 children, including a few girls, enrolled in these voluntary religious schools. In addition, a further 5,000 refugees are estimated to be enrolled in indigenous Pakistani primary schools, and a small but unknown number in local secondary and higher education facilities.

./...



UNICEF

UNITED NATIONS CHILDREN'S FUND
FONDS DES NATIONS UNIES POUR L'ENFANCE

file PAK

INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM

TO: Mr. N. D. Burleson
UNESCO Adviser to UNICEF

DATE: 23 December 1981

FILE NO.: ASPRO/81/214

FROM: Elizabeth A. Preble
Programme Officer, Asia Section

SUBJECT: UNESCO Proposal for Educational Needs of Refugees in Pakistan

Thank you for sharing this proposal. A few comments:

1. Our own information, which was collected in preparation for our 1982-1986 UNICEF Country Programme, confirms the UNESCO proposal's impression that primary education (especially for girls) is most neglected in this region. If you are interested, we can share with you the education components of our Programme Frameworks and Plans of Action for our programme for children and women in NWFP and Baluchistan, as well as the overall Statistical Profile of Children of Pakistan, which were prepared during the Country Programme process. The areas where refugees are congregated in organized camps may provide a unique opportunity for educational inputs, or expanded inputs.

2. While UNESCO proposal does recommend technical consultation to be provided by UNESCO consultants in Bangkok, is UNHCR expected to manage and execute the project? At the present time, UNICEF has only two international staff in Peshawar (and none in Baluchistan at this point) and the two in Peshawar are already over-extended with UNICEF's massive water supply project. Has there been any study of the present (or possible) inputs of NGOs in offering education? I believe there are several NGOs active in the camps.

3. Attached, for your information, are copies of the education components of the UNICEF Basic Assistance Lists for Baluchistan and NWFP. Please note, however, that these were formulated before consideration was made of the refugee situation, and may have changed substantially.

4. One of the staff members of Asia Section, Ms. Lena Hartono, has just returned from a short mission in Peshawar, and may be able to provide you with additional information about the current situation. Also, I have taken the liberty of passing a copy of this report on to our UNICEF Programme Officer in Peshawar, Mr. Martin Griffiths, for information.

Please do keep us informed of the outcome of this proposal.

With best holiday regards!

cc: Dr. Ramon Hermano
Mr. Martin Griffiths

Mr. Najmen, Re. your recent engniry concerning refugees in Pakistan. I will have more on this after 4 Jan 82.



United Nations Educational, Scientific
and Cultural Organization

With the compliments of
The UNESCO Adviser to UNICEF

David

NICEF Headquarters
United Nations
ew York N.Y. 10017

All best wishes

DEC 24 1981

UNESCO

united nations educational, scientific and cultural organization
organisation des nations unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

7, place de Fontenoy, 75700 PARIS

téléphone : *national* (1) 577 16 10
international + 33 1 577 16 10
télégrammes : Unesco Paris
télex : 204461 Paris

DEC 11 REC'D

référence : CPX/AFE/401/1222

2 December 1981

Dear Mr. Burleson,

Subject: Educational Needs of Refugees in Pakistan

With reference to 21C/Resolution 7/05 - Assistance for Refugees in Asia - which was adopted by the Belgrade General Conference, please find attached the report on the educational needs of refugees in Pakistan, prepared by Unesco consultant, Mr. A. Wheeler.

As the above-mentioned resolution invites the Director-General of Unesco to provide assistance to Asian refugees in co-operation with other concerned organizations, I should be grateful for your comments on the attached report and in particular, your suggestions in respect of Part V - Recommendations for Refugee Education.

Yours sincerely,

Dragoljub Najman
Assistant Director-General
Cooperation for Development and
External Relations Sector

Mr. N.D. Burleson,
Liaison Officer,
UNICEF,
R. A-6518,
866 United Nations Plaza, 6th Floor,
New York, N.Y. 10017,
U.S.A.